

For immediate release

Également disponible en français

BILL S-10 HURTS PEOPLE, FAMILIES AND PUBLIC COFFERS ***Over 200 experts call on Senators to be sensible on crime***

Toronto, 6 October 2010 — Over 200 frontline organizations, public health professionals, researchers and experts — working with people who use drugs and those vulnerable to HIV infection — have endorsed a letter calling on the federal government to get sensible, rather than tough on crime.

This action comes as the Senate Standing Committee on Legal and Constitutional Affairs deliberates this week on whether to hold hearings on Bill S-10 (*an Act to amend the Controlled Drugs and Substances Act and to make related and consequential amendments to other Acts*). The letter — endorsed by the Committee's own former co-chair, Senator Pierre Claude Nolin — urges Committee members to respond to the public health problem of drug addiction by focusing on scientifically proven approaches instead of demonstrably ineffective ones, such as mandatory minimum sentences. If the Committee chooses not to hold hearings, crucial expert testimony may never be heard.

“As currently drafted, Bill S-10 would target the most marginalized people living with addictions, whose only engagement with trafficking is often related to their drug dependence,” said Patricia Allard, Deputy Director of the Canadian HIV/AIDS Legal Network. “Additionally, a Canadian study found that over 80 percent of federally incarcerated women are mothers of minor children. Are child-service agencies prepared for the number of legal orphans likely to land on their doorsteps should S-10 see the light of day?”

“The 30-year war on drugs waged by the U.S. government, and its disastrous experiments with mandatory sentencing, offer all the evidence we need that incarcerating people for minor drug offences is counterproductive to addressing the issue of addiction and is detrimental to public health,” stated Walter Cavalieri, Chair of the Canadian Harm Reduction Network.

According to Ms. Allard, “evidence shows that imprisoning people who inject drugs fans the flames of Canada's HIV epidemic. The HIV prevalence rate in Canadian prisons is at least 10 times that found in the population as a whole.”

“Our coffers are clearly not safe with the current government,” said Cavalieri. “No thorough fiscal impact assessment of Bill S-10 has been completed, but it’s likely to slam not only the federal but also the provincial and territorial budgets.”

– 30 –

About the Canadian HIV/AIDS Legal Network

Since 1992, the Canadian HIV/AIDS Legal Network (www.aidslaw.ca) has been promoting the human rights of people living with and vulnerable to HIV/AIDS, in Canada and internationally, through research, legal and policy analysis, education, and community mobilization. The Legal Network is Canada’s leading advocacy organization working on the legal and human rights issues raised by HIV/AIDS.

For more information and to arrange interviews:

Gilleen Witkowski
Communications Assistant
Tel: +1 416 595-1666 ext. 240
E-mail: gwitkowski@aidslaw.ca

October 6, 2010
Ottawa

Clerk of the Standing Committee on Legal and Constitutional Affairs
Senate of Canada
Ottawa, Ontario
Canada, K1A 0A4

Clerk of the Standing Committee on Justice and Human Rights
House of Commons
Ottawa, Ontario
Canada, K1A 0A4

As front-line organizations, researchers and experts who work with people who use drugs, we write to express our opposition to Bill S-10, an *Act to amend the Controlled Drugs and Substances Act and to make related and consequential amendments to other Acts*.

The Government has characterized Bill S-10 as getting tough on serious drug crimes in order to ensure the safety and security of neighbourhoods and communities. However, the Department of Justice concluded in a 2002 review that the imposition of mandatory minimum sentences for drug offences has little impact on crime. Furthermore, the experience in the United States with mandatory minimum sentences for drug offences over the last two decades has been disastrous, doing nothing to “solve” the drug problem except wreaking terrible damage on individuals (including those with addictions), families and communities, and exacerbating the harms to public health associated with problematic drug use.

Bill S-10 represents an intensification of punishment and imprisonment in response to drugs that has not to date yielded any substantial, sustained benefits. In particular:

Mandatory minimum sentences don't work

The evidence demonstrates that mandatory minimum sentences are ineffective because convicting people of drug-related offences does not reduce the problems associated with drug use. Justice Canada's own review of the evidence in 2002 concluded that mandatory minimum sentences are “least effective in relation to drug offences” and that “drug consumption and drug-related crime seem to be unaffected, in any measurable way, by severe [mandatory minimum sentences].”

Mandatory minimum sentences harm people with addictions, not large-scale traffickers

Bill S-10 will predominantly affect people who are addicted to drugs and involved in small-scale, street-level drug distribution to support their drug use. Studies have shown that of the most vulnerable, street-involved people who use drugs, many are involved in low-level tasks such as carrying drugs and steering buyers towards

dealers. The real profiteers in the drug market distance themselves from visible drug-trafficking activities and are rarely captured by law-enforcement efforts. The brunt of mandatory minimum sentences will be borne by people with addictions, not organized crime and gang leaders.

These sentencing provisions are also likely to apply to many young people and students for experimenting with drugs, as well as women who are dependent on drug-involved partners. Already in Canada, a significant percentage of women in prison have been incarcerated for offences related to drug use, many of whom are mothers of minor children. Because mothers who are incarcerated are most often sole caregivers to their children, there may be no alternative caregiver for the children after her arrest, resulting in countless numbers of legal orphans. Incarceration thus carries the societal costs of disrupting families and children. By casting the net of incarceration so widely as to encompass a significant number of people convicted of non-violent offences or offences that could better be managed in the community, Bill S-10 will not protect our communities from gangs and organized crime, but will instead put some of the most vulnerable people in our society behind bars, as well as young people with otherwise bright futures and others far removed from any violent or high-profit drug trade.

Incarceration does not diminish drug-related street activity, violence or petty crime

There is no empirical support and no examples from other jurisdictions to establish that crime rates will decrease as a result of increasing incarceration, including for drug-related offences. On the contrary, drug law enforcement practices aimed to disrupt drug markets may have the unintentional effect of increasing levels of drug market violence.

Incarceration doesn't address addiction

Putting people who use drugs in prison does not get them the help they need to deal with the problems that contribute to harmful drug use. For example, research has established that, without treatment, most people with heroin addiction who are incarcerated will return to using heroin following release. Moreover, following a prison sentence, employment prospects are limited and challenges such as inadequate housing and experiences of violence and abuse persist.

More imprisonment of people who use drugs is bad for public health

Putting more people, including people with addictions, in prison for drug offences is harmful to the public's health. Numerous studies in Canada and elsewhere show that people in prison have much higher levels of infection of HIV and hepatitis C virus (HCV), rates which are increased through incarceration. Bill S-10 would mean putting more people who are already vulnerable to HIV and HCV infection in prison, where drug use will continue, often with even higher risks for transmission of these blood-borne infections because incarcerated people lack access to sterile injecting equipment. This makes prisons less safe, not only for people behind bars but also for prison staff. Furthermore, incarcerated people's health directly affects public health, since the vast majority of them return to families and communities. As a matter of

public health, we should keep people who use drugs out of prison, not impose mandatory prison terms.

Mandatory minimums waste public resources in imposing unjust sentences

The “aggravating factors” included in Bill S-10 that trigger mandatory prison sentences cast the net so widely as to include a significant number of non-violent offences. The societal, fiscal and health-related costs of imprisonment are much too high to be imposed automatically in every case where a minimum sentence is triggered by factors such as being “in or near an area normally frequented by youth” or having been previously convicted of another substance offence within the previous 10 years — in essence, a rule of “two-strikes-and-you’re-out”. Judges need flexibility in order to ensure that sentences are tailored to a particular individual, the unique circumstances and a specific offence. With judges’ hands tied, inappropriate and unduly harsh sentences are guaranteed to be handed down.

Moreover, as reported by Parliamentary budget officer Kevin Page, a slew of pending crime bills will create significant ongoing future costs to be borne by taxpayers. Bill C-25, a bill that was passed to limit credit given for time served in pre-sentencing custody, will alone cost between \$7 and 10 billion over the next five years, as well as swell prison populations and already-stretched building facilities. While the direct financial cost of ineffective crime bills is shocking in itself, such calculations do not take into account the devastating social costs of incarceration on Canadian families, as well as the indirect costs of an overburdened and under-resourced child welfare system.

In light of the evidence that mandatory prison terms for drug offences have little, if any, effect in reducing crime, but impose significant financial, human and societal costs while undermining public health, Bill S-10 is an inefficient and counter-productive misuse of public funds that could be better spent on evidence-based prevention, treatment and harm reduction programs.

Instead of further criminalizing and marginalizing people, government policy should support communities and front-line workers in responding to the public health problem of drug addiction and related harms. We therefore urge your refocus on scientifically proven approaches to addressing drug use and drug-related crime within Canada, approaches that work for people who use drugs and for our communities more broadly.

Organizations

- | | |
|--|---|
| 1. The Canadian Harm Reduction Network | 5. End Prohibition |
| 2. Empowerment Council | 6. Canadian Students for Sensible Drug Policy (CSSDP) |
| 3. Harm Reduction Joint Action Team | |
| 4. PEERS Victoria | |

7. Canadian AIDS Treatment Information Exchange / Réseau canadien d'info-traitements sida
8. AIDS Saint John
9. AIDS Thunder Bay
10. Breakaway Addiction Services
11. Peel HIV/AIDS Network
12. Positive Women's Network
13. Many Rivers
14. Toronto Police Accountability Coalition
15. The Health Officers Council of BC
16. Queer Ontario
17. Harm Reduction Victoria
18. Interagency Coalition on AIDS and Development / Coalition interagence sida et développement
19. Family Service Toronto
20. Frontline Partners with Youth (FPYN)
21. Parkdale Community Health Centre
22. Canadian Treatment Action Council / Conseil canadien de surveillance et d'accès aux traitements
23. Canadian AIDS Society / Société canadienne du sida
24. BC Persons with AIDS Society
25. Sandy Hill Community Health Centre
26. Housing Homelessness Services
27. National Specialty Society for Community Medicine (NSSCM)
28. l'Association des médecins spécialistes en sante communautaire du Québec
29. Inner City Health Associates
30. Support & Housing - Halton
31. AIDS Committee of Toronto (ACT)
32. National Alliance for Medication Assisted Recovery
33. Elizabeth Fry Society of Saskatchewan
34. Prisoners' HIV/AIDS Support Action Network

35. Coalition des organismes communautaires québécois de lutte contre le sida
36. Caerleon Group
37. National African Integration and Families Association
38. Notre Dame of St. Agatha Inc.
39. Canadian Drug Policy Consortium
40. Canadian HIV/AIDS Legal Network / Réseau juridique canadien VIH/sida

Individuals

1. Graham Stewart
2. Claire Corriveau
3. Glenn Betteridge
4. Walter Cavalieri, The Canadian Harm Reduction Network
5. Susan Little
6. Jeff Reinhart
7. Smadar Carmon
8. Margaret Childs
9. Brandon Williams, Below the Surface Coaching
10. Desmond Cohen
11. Meryll Bear
Director, National Eating Disorder Information Centre
12. Mark Wilson, Manager of
Counselling and Support Services,
WoodGreen Community Services
13. Ruta Jazokas
14. Elizabeth Hay, Research
Coordinator, Health and Housing in
Transition (HHiT)
15. Max Rowsell
Harm Reduction Worker, Youth
Services Bureau
16. Bruce Alexander
17. Stephanie Venneri, Addiction
Counsellor, Breakaway Addiction
Services- Satellite Opiate Treatment
18. Bernard Bertrand
19. Doug Surtees
20. Mike Baranik
21. Dulce Feder

22. Catherine Carney White, Executive Director, Herizon House
23. Andree Perreault
24. Daryn Bond
25. Connie Koch, Addictions Counsellor, Alberta Health Services-Addictions
26. David C Marsh, Associate Dean, Northern Ontario School of Medicine
27. Doris Marshall, Executive Director, Lanark County Community Justice Program
28. Vincent Simon, Executive Director, Ka-Na-Chi-Hih Solvent Abuse Treatment Centre
29. Ginetta Salvalaggio
30. Barbara Ncho, Outreach Worker, AIDS Committee of Durham Region
31. Devon MacFarlane
32. Connor McCollum
33. Jean-Sebastien Fallu, Assistant Professor, École de psycho-éducation, Université de Montréal
34. Bruce Tanaka
35. Aki Tanaka
36. Rei Tanaka
37. Carol Francey, Staff, BC Provincial Government Alcohol and Drug Services
38. Lesley Brathwaite, Program Coordinator, Abbotsford Addictions Centre
39. Jose Sousa
40. Kylie Somerville, Outreach Counsellor, Breakaway Addiction Services
41. Gary Bloch, Family Physician/Assistant Professor, St. Michael's Hospital, University of Toronto
42. Michael Fitch, member, Canadian Harm Reduction
43. Angela Neufeld, Counsellor, Student Services/ Yukon College
44. Ernie Lacasse
45. Abdul Hai Patel
46. Sarah Levitt
47. Isaac Sobol, Chief Medical Officer of Health, Government of Nunavut
48. Lisa Schmidt Winsor, Director, Organizational Development
49. Emily Dragoman
50. Ingrid Wirsig
51. Lisa Berger, AMOH, Communicable Disease Control, Toronto Public Health
52. Anna Willats, Faculty, George Brown College
53. Liz Pounsett
54. R.A Milne
55. Cheryl Bate
56. Paul Kohn
57. Karen Fong
58. Ken Monteith, Executive Director, COCQ-SIDA
59. Jennifer Floyd, Social Worker
60. Gayle Rutherford, Assistant Professor, Faculty of Nursing, University of Calgary
61. Leo Murphy, Assistant Professor of Psychiatry, University of Toronto
62. Jane Thurley
63. Lauren St. Louis
64. Nicole Seguin, National Director, End Prohibition
65. Lawrence Demoskoff
66. Dan Reist, Centre for Addictions Research of BC, University of Victoria
67. Kimberly Sharpe
68. Gillian Kolla, PhD student, University of Toronto
69. Ray Morris
70. Janet Pal
71. James Leslie, member, L.E.A.P.
72. Rhonwen Derbez
73. Naomi Nurgitz, Mindfulness Based Stress Reduction Workshops
74. Theresa Campbell, caseworker, East Toronto Employment & Social Services City of Toronto
75. William Johnston

76. Beth Bromberg, Barrister and Solicitor
77. Simon Owen, Criminal Lawyer, Bird & Thatcher
78. Andrew Griffin
79. Louise Thompson, Public Health Nurse, Sexual Health/Needle Exchange Program
80. Corbin Cawkell
81. Nancy Thurston, Harm Reduction
82. Lynn Burnett, Ottawa Inner City Health Inc
83. Martin Zack, Scientist, Centre for Addiction and Mental Health
84. John Caffery, Project Coordinator, Centre for Social Innovation
85. Susan Boyd, Professor, University of Victoria
86. Darryl MacNeil, Counselling Psychology, Sister Margaret Smith Centre
87. Laura Levin, Harm Reduction Specialist, Woodgreen Community Services
88. Chris Keefer, MedPortal
89. Marco Gomes, Research Study coordinator, PWA Toronto
90. Angus MacIntyre
91. Courtney Gardner, Student, Carleton University
92. Violette Pedneault
93. Sarah Prowse
94. Kathy Morgan, Homeless Outreach, Centretown Community Health Centre
95. Suzanne Coulson, Simcoe Muskoka District Health Unit
96. Glenn Sandberg
97. Kristin Vanderwiel, HR Assistant, Kingston Community Health Centre
98. Natalie Davis
99. Michael Connidis
100. Adele Monaco
101. Michelle Kushniruk, Research Coordinator, Department of Sociology, University of Saskatchewan
102. Jennifer Osborne
103. Mikael Jansson, University of Victoria
104. Cameron Ballard
105. Nikki Gravelle
106. Judith Malik
107. Deb Kinder, Women & HIV/AIDS Community Development Coordinator, HIV/AIDS Regional Services
108. Edward Kruk, Associate Professor, University of British Columbia
109. Angela Morley
110. Pat Keating
111. Eloha Bouchard, MotherHouse Entertainment
112. Jami Watkin
113. Gary Roche, Community Support Worker, AIDS Committee of Guelph and Wellington County
114. Hope McIntyre, Artistic Director, Sarasvati Production
115. Darlene James, AHS Addiction & Mental Health
116. Alison Cumbaa, Parkdale Community Legal Services
117. Kalev Anniko, Law Student Case Worker, Parkdale Community Legal Services
118. Mary Veltri
119. Susan Haines
120. Gwen Smith
121. Kelly Burgess, Sex trade Outreach Worker, Agincourt Community Services Association
122. Louise McKissick
123. Darcy Marin
124. Genevieve Joss
125. Scott Simpson
126. H. John Kalina
127. Stephanie Claivaz-Loranger, Lawyer, COCQ-SIDA
128. Aaron Kucharczuk, Law Student Case Worker, Parkdale Community Legal Services
129. Melanie MacKenzie, Community Legal Worker, Kinna-aweya Legal Clinic

130. Dilia Santos-Maloney, General
Counsellor, COSTI Reception Centre
131. Ross Sutherland
132. Thomas Phone
133. Rebecca Cunningham Andre,
Downtown Community Health Clinic
134. Elizabeth McCarville, Program
Coordinator, AIDS Coalition of Nova
Scotia
135. Jenny Katz, Network Coordination,
Centre for Social Innovation
136. Donald MacPherson, Co-Founder,
Canadian Drug Policy Consortium
137. Shaun Hopkins
138. Tori Allen
139. Farzana Doctor, Psychotherapist
and Consultant
140. Sara Brown, Admissions
Coordinator, Sunshine Coast Health
Centre
141. Bo Yih Thom, Counsellor, Harm
Reduction Outreach Team
(Breakaway)
142. Douglas Guest
143. Naomi Berlyne
144. Amy Steele
145. Barry Beaupre
146. Carol Polych
147. Donald B. Ross
148. Pat Montague
149. Adam Newman
150. Anne-Marie DiCenso, Executive
Director, PASAN
151. Don Grant, Substance Abuse
Representative, CAW AGS
Automotive
152. Tara Johnston, Public Health Nurse,
Sexual Health Team / Perth District
Health Unit
153. Shauna Derksen
154. Pierre Claude Nolin, Senator, The
Senate of Canada
155. Kelly Sexsmith, Counsellor /
Methadone Case Manager, Street
Health Centre, Kingston Community
Health Centres
156. Dionne A. Falconer
157. Morgen Patterson, Student-at-law,
Parkdale Community Legal Services
158. Jocelyne Thiffault, Médecin
Conseil, Agence de Santé et de
Services sociaux de Laval
159. Justine Barone, Newcomer Liaison
Counsellor and Outreach Counsellor,
Elizabeth Fry Toronto
160. Natasha Beaudin
161. Adam Wookey
162. Brian Childs
163. Dan Rheault
164. Yvan Fortin, Coordination,
Liaisons avec les communautés-
prévention
165. Shane Patey
166. Nicole April
167. David Reycraft, Director, Housing
Homelessness Services
168. Anabel Khoo
169. Ethel Whitty, Director, Carnegie
Community Centre
170. Giselle Dias
171. John Smith, Executive Director,
Support & Housing - Halton
172. Sarah Kobayashi, Social Work
Clinician, Oak Tree Clinic
173. Marko Ivancicevic, Oshawa
Compassion Society
174. Lynne Kropman
175. Judith Chopra
176. Henry Wai
177. Caroleen Wright, Executive
Director, Elizabeth Fry Society of
Saskatchewan
178. Michelle Kushniruk, Department of
Sociology, University of
Saskatchewan
179. Ken Monteith, Directeur général,
COCQ-SIDA
180. Tracy Campbell, Human Resources
Consultant, Caerleon Group
181. Matthew Harmer, Registered Nurse
182. Richard Sullivan, UBC

183. Nathan Okonta, Program Director,
National African Integration and
Families Association
184. Rebecca Penn, Dalla Lana School
of Public Health
185. Stephanie Hendrickson, MSW
graduate student, Lakehead University
186. Clemon George, Assistant
Professor, University of Ontario
Institute of Technology
187. Solomon Husain-Zuberi, Special
Projects Coordinator, Talking
Intersections / Building Connection,
Qmunity: BC's Queer Resource Centre
188. Ester Orozco, Union
Representative, CUPW
189. Gary Newman, Director, CTI-
Breaking the Cycle
190. Peter Williams, Education /
Prevention Coordinator, PARN, Your
Community AIDS Resource Network
191. Carolyn Showler, Registered Nurse,
Cool Aid Community Health Center
192. Constance Koch
193. Omer Vandevyvere, Program
Coordinator, Addiction Services of
Thames Valley
194. Tamara Elliott, Early Years Social
Worker, Parents for Better Beginnings,
Regent Park Community Health
Centre
195. Judith Chopra, President and Chair,
Board of Directors, Notre Dame of St.
Agatha Inc.
196. Irina Sytcheva, Policy and
Advocacy Coordinator, Schizophrenia
Society of Ontario
197. Darlene James, Program
Consultant, Alberta Health Services /
Addiction and Mental Health
198. Dan O'Brien
199. Patricia Allard, Deputy Director,
Canadian HIV/AIDS Legal Network
200. Richard Elliott, Executive Director,
Canadian HIV/AIDS Legal Network

cc:

The Honourable Leona Aglukkaq, Minister of Health Canada
The Honourable Kevin Falcon, Minister of Health for British Columbia
The Honourable Don McMorris, Minister of Health for Saskatchewan
The Honourable Theresa Oswald, Minister of Health for Manitoba
The Honourable Mary Schryer, Minister of Health for New Brunswick
The Honourable Gene Zwozdesky, Minister of Health and Wellness for Alberta
The Honourable Jerome Kennedy, Minister of Health and Community Services for Newfoundland and Labrador
The Honourable Carolyn Bertram, Minister of Health and Social Services for Prince Edward Island
The Honourable Tagak Curley, Minister of Health and Social Services for Nunavut
The Honourable Maureen MacDonald, Minister of Health and Health Promotion & Protection for Nova Scotia
The Honourable Deb Matthews, Minister of Health & Long-Term Care for Ontario
The Honourable Sandy Lee, Minister of Health and Social Services for Northwest Territories
The Honourable Glenn Hart, Minister of Health and Social Services for Yukon Territory
Dr. Yves Bolduc, Minister of Health and Social Services of Quebec
The Honourable Robert Douglas Nicholson, Minister of Justice and Attorney General of Canada
The Honourable Alison Redford, Minister of Justice and Attorney General for Alberta
The Honourable Michael de Jong, Attorney General for British Columbia
The Honourable Andrew Swan, Minister of Justice and Attorney General for Manitoba
The Honourable Kelly Lamrock Q.C., Minister of Justice and Attorney General for New Brunswick
The Honourable Felix Collins, Minister of Justice and Attorney General for Newfoundland and Labrador
The Honourable Jackson Lafferty, Minister of Justice and Attorney General for Northwest Territories
The Honourable Ross Landry, Attorney General of Nova Scotia
The Honourable Keith Peterson, Minister of Justice for Nunavut
The Honourable Chris Bentley, Attorney General of Ontario
The Honourable Doug Currie, Attorney General of Prince Edward Island
The Honourable Jean-Marc Fournier, Attorney General of Quebec
The Honourable Don Morgan Q.C. Minister of Justice and Attorney General for Saskatchewan
The Honourable Marian Horne, Minister of Justice for Yukon Territory